

THE MASS SERIES : ART & LITURGY I : CHURCH MUSIC

BY FR IAN ANDREW PALKO, FSSPX

INTRODUCTION

- **Something very special about music, almost innate and natural to it.**

- Example : Jacob Collier's Audience Choir
 - An audience that simply attended a concert of a man who is known as an eclectic music virtuoso, has not practiced any song or been given any music
 - Jacob starts them humming or singing a note, then divides them into parts, then starts signaling to go up and down in pitch,
 - He is able to help guide them to create chords and melodies without giving them notes, simply by knowing where at least 50% of his sections will tend to go when he points, and they will settle on beautiful, often very complex harmonies (with suspended chords or striking dissonances).
- Pius XII (*Musicae Sacrae*, §4):

Music is among the many and great gifts of nature with which God, in Whom is the harmony of the most perfect concord and the most perfect order, has enriched men, whom He has created in His image and likeness.

- **The use of art in worship, whether Jewish, Christian, or even pagan, always included art, especially musical art**

- The sacrificial instruments and vestment were adorned with jewels and detailed carvings
- Statues and images, along with altars were built, often highly decorated
- The Pythagoreans, Plato, Ptolemy, Aristoxenus, and Philodemus provide a detailed history of Greek music and music theory, which is deeply connected to the whole Greek mythology and religion
 - It is worthy noting that the Greeks lacked a priestly cast, so often this role was played by a magistrate, or some political leader (mirroring what would naturally have happened, without revelation)
 - This also means that the ceremonies were very different in different places, but all are associated with some music, particularly hymns.
- Consider the precise instructions given by God for the Ark, the ceremonies, the vestments of the priests, the rites of the sacrifice, and the altars and temples.
- Christian music grew out of a double source : (1) Jewish religious music of the temple and (2) Greco-Roman secular and religious music and metric hymns.
 - The Jews employed at least eight different instruments (the *Mishna* mentions 12 instruments) in temple worship including a 12-stringed harp, 10-stringed lyre, a ram's horn trumpet, a silver trumpet, a drum, cymbals, bells, and a large flute.
 - The Jews additionally employed the voice in worship, though, the exact manner of this is unclear.
 - There was clearly a cantor who needed to be skilled at singing complex melodies
 - Those attending made responses, as is evidence by certain repetitive psalms (e.g. "His mercy endureth forever"), the "Amen" and "Alleluia."
 - In 2 Para 5:13, the dedication of the temple indicates the playing of instruments, singing of psalms, and trumpet all in a kind of unity.
 - St. Hilary, during his exile in the Arian crisis, was exposed to the metrical hymns and poetry in the East, and wrote many of the early Western liturgical hymns, bringing this usage into the West.

- St. Ambrose, who in Milan (the then capital of the Roman Empire), was exposed to both Eastern and Western liturgical art, wrote many doctrinal hymns, whose purpose was not only liturgical service, but also catechesis.
 - The heretic Arius already was using poetry and music to teach his heretical denial of Christ's divinity back in the early 300s,
 - St. Ambrose and other saw the power of music as a vehicle for doctrine.
- **The Liturgy is the Worship of Christ, through His Mystical Body to His Father**
 - At Mass, this is most evident, where the Sacramentally-immolated Son is offered to the Father as was accomplished on the Cross.
 - Yet, the other prayers of the Mass make obvious that this is not the only way to offer the highest worship to God.
 - Outside of the Mass, in the other liturgical actions, like the Divine Office (Matins, Lauds, the Minor Hours, Vespers, Compline), the very Word of God (the psalms and canticles) are not just read but prayed, by the Mystical Body (the Son) to the Father.
- **From the earliest days, the Church and Christians employed art, especially music in their worship, both private and liturgical**
- **“He who sings prays twice”?**
 - Sometimes “He who sings well, prays twice”
 - Often attributed to St. Augustine, it's not actually a real quote, though it does seem to embody his spirit for he says in commenting on Psalm 74:

Qui enim cantat laudem, non solum laudat, sed etiam hilariter laudat ("He who sings praises, not only praises, but praises with joy"). (St. Augustine, *Enaritiones in Psalmis*, 74,1)

- He who does not sing well, prays for forgiveness, I guess.

PURPOSE OF SACRED MUSIC

The liturgy is inherently linked to beauty: it is *veritatis splendor* ... Beauty, then, is not mere decoration, but rather an essential element of the liturgical action, since it is an attribute of God himself and his revelation. (Benedict XVI, *Sacramentum caritatis* §35)

- **St. Augustine's Mother's Funerary Rites**
 - St. Augustine recounts in Book IX of his *Confessions* his experience with the death of his mother.
 - Amongst the highlights of his account is the music he hears as part of the liturgical rites for the dead

[!] then being stilled from weeping, Euodius took up the Psalter, and began to sing, our whole house answering him, the Psalm, *Misericordiam et iudicium cantabo tibi, Domine* (Ps. 100). (St. Augustine, *Confessions*, lib. ix., 8.

- But just before this, speaking about his time in Milan, and hearing the chants that had been brought from the Eastern Church to that city :

How did I weep, in Thy Hymns and Canticles, touched to the quick by the voices of Thy sweet-attuned Church! The voices flowed into mine ears, and the Truth distilled into my heart, whence the affections of my devotion overflowed, and tears ran down, and happy was I therein. (St. Augustine, *Confessions*, lib. ix., 6.

- The point of music isn't merely to stir the emotions :

It is necessary to note that the enjoyment of these compositions give has never been the criterion that justifies sacred things. (Cardinal Giuseppe Sarto, *Votum* (1893), pt.1.9(c).

- Of course this is not what St. Augustine means, but instead he highlights the nature of liturgical music to help communicate truth, and to perfect divine worship.
- **Practical Considerations**
 - Singing the didactic parts of the Mass (Lessons, Epistle, Gospel) make these much easier to hear in large churches.
 - The sung voice, naturally slows the pace, and allows clear
 - The sung voice carries much more easily, and allows projection without yelling
 - This is why the tones for the Lessons, Epistles, and Gospels are very simple
 - The simple lessons tone is monotone except for the end of a phrase (drop of a perfect fourth, Do-to-Fa or C-F)
 - The solemn lesson tone is still simple overall, with the ending being a Do-Sol-La-Fa ending. A slight enhancement, without too much complexity.
 - The normal Epistle tone is entirely monotone, while the more common alternative tone has more complex endings, but still is essentially monotone.
 - The Gospel tones are all extremely simple, more like the Lessons, so that the Gospel is heard very clearly.
 - The purpose here is to be able to hear these clearly
 - Those parts which are not where the faithful need to clearly hear
 - The perfection of the liturgy is the Pontifical or Solemn Mass, which is Sung.
 - Low Mass, or recited prayers are essentially equal, but far from the Church's ideal.
- Principles of Sacred Music as outlined by St. Pius X : Sanctity, Correctness of Art, Universality

STRUCTURE OF MUSIC FOR THE ROMAN LITURGY

- **Four-fold division of liturgical music**
 - Antiphons :
 - Short texts set to music which are normally context/theme for a psalm or canticle
 - Longer antiphon-psalms are often shortened into a single verse of a psalm or simply the antiphon alone for Mass, Blessings, Processions, etc.
 - The *Introit* of the Mass was originally an antiphon with a full psalm used as a processional.
 - Shortened by the Missal of 1570 (likely during the Middle Ages for Low Masses) to typically an antiphon, verse, Gloria Patri, and the repetition of the antiphon.
 - The Liturgical Movement encouraged the return of using the full psalm as a processional, or additional verses of the psalm
 - (e.g. Holy Thursday provides these extra verses and instructs the use of the *Introit* as the processional).
 - The *Communion* is also an antiphon, but without any psalms attached anymore
 - Historically, this antiphon would employ, like the *Introit*, a full psalm or canticle, and repeat as needed during the Communion of the faithful
 - When it became rare that the faithful would receive during Mass, it was necessary to shorten it
 - One example that remains is the *Lux Æterna* of the Requiem Mass.
 - During the Divine Office there is always an antiphon which gives context to a psalm that is recited or sung

- At the major hours (Matins, Lauds, and Vespers) there is an antiphon for each of the psalms
- At the minor hours (Prime, Terce, Sext, None, and Compline) there is an antiphon for the group of three psalms.
- One can think of this as the “mystery” for a decade of the Rosary, which is supposed to provide something to contemplate during the decade (or in the case of the psalm, the length of the psalm).
- Responsories :
 - Short texts, where a group of singers (or the whole group of faithful) sing a refrain, and then verses by a smaller group are interspersed.
 - For example : *In manus tua* of Compline :
 - Cantor sings “In manus tua Domine, commendo spiritum meum.”
 - All repeat this
 - Cantor adds a versicle “Redimisti nos, Domine Deus, Veritatis.”
 - All repeat the second part of the refrain “Commendo...”
 - The cantor sings the “Gloria Patri”
 - All repeat the whole refrain
 - The cantor sings a simple versicle, and the faithful respond.
 - The Offertory of the Mass is a Responsory, but now shortened to just the refrain section.
 - There used to be several versicles that would be added, but, similar to the Introit and Communion, these were shortened, likely on account of the Low Masses.
 - The musical part of the liturgical movements developed an *Offertoriale* wherein some of these Offertory responsories are restored for optional use.
 - The Gradual, Tract, and Alleluia, are also examples of Responsorial structures, even if now, they omit a return to any refrain.
 - This is why they are sung with a small group intoning, the whole schola joining, then a smaller group alternating the verses, with all joining at the end of the piece.
 - The Paschal Alleluia is more clearly a Responsory in structure, though with the change in modes between some, it can seem like two disjointed pieces depending on how it is executed.
 - Most of the Offices contains many responsories
 - Matins has these after each Lesson
 - Lauds and Vespers are missing these
 - The minor hours have a “Short Responsory” like the Compline one above.
- Hymns :
 - Poetic metric texts set to a simple chant that all can sing
 - This is why, even the more beautiful and complex Gregorian hymns are still, overall, very simple, and with just a bit of practice, easy for almost all to sing
 - If we compare these simple Gregorian melodies to some of the problematic and forbidden hymns from the 19th and 20th centuries, we find how inappropriate these later are.
 - The Sequence of the Mass is a kind of extended hymn, often a bit more complex
- Psalms/Canticles
 - The Gregorian system uses very simple repetitive chants for each verse with a middle and ending that can easily be followed.

- There are 8+1 modes, each with their own character, and then many different endings to help maintain pace, and the character of the music (somber, joyful, mysterious), etc.
 - The antiphons that introduce these also introduce a modal melody that the psalm reflects
 - There are three New Testament Canticles that are employed regularly
 - *Benedictus* (Canticle of Zachary) at Lauds
 - *Magnificat* (Canticle of the BVM) at Vespers
 - *Nunc Dimitis* (Canticle of Simeon) at Compline
 - There are 13 Old Testament Canticles that are employed regularly all at Lauds:
 - *Benedicite* (Canticle of the Three Young Men) Sunday Lauds I
 - There is a shortened version at Sunday Lauds II
 - *Benedictus es* (Canticle of David) at Monday Lauds I
 - *Confitebor tibi* (Canticle of Isaias) at Monday Lauds II
 - *Magnus es* (Canticle of Tobias) at Tuesday Lauds I
 - *Ego dixi* (Canticle of Ezechias) at Tuesday Lauds II
 - *Hymnum cantemus* (Canticle of Judith) at Wednesday Lauds I
 - *Exultavit cor meum* (Canticle of Anna) at Wednesday Lauds II
 - *Audite verbum Domini* (Canticle of Jerimias) at Thursday Lauds I
 - *Cantemus Domino* (Canticle of Moses) at Thursday Lauds II
 - *Vere tu es Deus absconditus* (Canticle of Isaias) at Friday Lauds I
 - *Domine audivi auditionam tuam* (Canticle of Habacuc) at Friday Lauds II
 - *Miserere nostril Deus* (Canticle of Ecclesiasticus) at Saturday Lauds I
 - *Audite cæli* (Canticle of Moses) at Saturday Lauds II
 - All of the psalms and canticles are an example of praying Scripture.
 - Unlike Protestants who try to study Scripture only
 - Catholics use the Word of God to pray to God
 - In fact, when one looks at the whole liturgy (Divine Office and Mass) the vast majority of it are words taken directly from Scripture.
 - At least 75% of the text of the liturgy comes directly from Scripture.
 - Likely about 15% is from the Fathers of the Church, the Popes, or is a summary of the Acts of the Popes/Church
 - Only about 10%, mostly the prayers of the Canon of the Mass, are taken from outside of the Scripture, but these are likely mostly of Apostolic origin, or at least very early origin.
- **The Musical Structure of the Roman Mass**
 - Introit (Processional) Antiphon :
 - Consists of an antiphon taken from the Psalms, Scripture, or some text written for the liturgical day itself, with at least one verse of a psalm, the Gloria Patri (except during Passiontide ferias), and a repetition of the antiphon
 - The purpose of this was to give a theme or character to the Mass of that day, provide some material for contemplation, and also to provide something the clergy could sing while the procession approached the altar
 - Kyrie :
 - The Kyrie is a form of Responsory, which comes from the Litany of the Saints, which it bookends.

- In Rome, the Pope would celebrate Mass each day at a different (stational) church, from which the next day's procession to the new church would set out, singing the Litany, which ends with the *Kyrie eleison*, which became the beginning of the Mass at the new church.
 - This practice still exists in the *Easter Vigil*, which is why the *Kyrie eleison* is solemnly intoned as the clergy process in after changing vestments and decorating the altar
 - Gloria
 - A doxological hymn
 - Gradual, Alleluia, Tract, Sequence
 - A series of modified responsories (and a hymn in the case of the Sequence)
 - Credo
 - A kind of hymn
 - Offertory
 - Responsory
 - Agnus Dei
 - A kind of responsory
 - Communion
 - Antiphon without psalm
- **The Musical Structure of the Roman Divine Office**
 - Matins
 - Invitatory antiphon and Psalm (in a responsorial manner)
 - Hymn
 - 9 Psalms with antiphons (in one group of 9 or three of three, called nocturns)
 - Three (or nine) lessons depending on if there is one or three nocturns
 - Responsories after each lesson
 - Te Deum hymn
 - Lauds (and Vespers)
 - 5 Psalms with antiphons (4 Psalms and 1 Canticle for Lauds)
 - Short Scriptural Reading
 - Hymn
 - Antiphon and Benedictus/Magnificat
 - Prayer and Conclusion
 - Minor Hours (Prime, Terce, Sext, None, and Compline)
 - Slight variations but all include:
 - 3 Psalms with one antiphon
 - A short lesson or Scripture reading
 - A short responsory
 - A hymn
 - Compline includes a Canticle with an antiphon.
 - Prayer and Conclusion

RULES FOR SACRED MUSIC

- **Anterior to Pian Reform**
 - Popes have been regulating sacred music to some degree from at least the 5th century, but more recently the Council of Trent, a no less than 10 Popes afterward address this topic.

- There was already a tendency to deviate from the Gregorian melodies as model for Sacred Music

- Benedict XIV, *Annus qui hunc* (1749)

[We] admonish You ... that polyphonic music, which is now received by custom in churches, and which is usually accompanied by the harmony of the organ and of other instruments, should be established in such a way that nothing profane, nothing worldly, nor theatrical, should be heard.

- This was not a Classical era problem, since the Council of Toledo (1566) decreed:

It is absolutely necessary to avoid the musical sound that brings something theatrical in the singing of the divine praises; or that evokes profane loves, and warlike deeds, as classical music usually does.

- **Pope St. Pius X**

- Despite his rudimentary education in youth, the man was a self-studied expert in Sacred Music, and deeply knowledgeable about its history, proper form, and utility
 - 1908 Letter to Msgr. Fortunato and the Canons of Chiavari asked for a “crown” for their image of the crucified Christ to which was attributed miracles
 - The Pope refused, gently, using two obscure Gregorian chants at his theological argument.
 - He cites the fourth verse of the Lauds hymn *Exite, Sion Filiae* for the feast of the Receiving of the Crown of Thorns (which is not in the universal calendar)
 - He also cites *Legis Figuris Pingitur* the Lauds hymn for the Friday after Quinquagesima Sunday, both on the Crown of Thorns.
 - The lengthy Vota issued as Patriarch of Venice on Church Music is extremely detailed and full of good artistic principles.
 - Thus, he was not just some saintly bishop/pope with a few ideas. He knew the subject deeply, and his principles given in *Tra le sollicitudine* are solid and Catholic
- He was deeply scandalized in his own experience by what passed for Church Music.
 - The Motu Proprio *Tra le sollicitudini* (1903) spends its opening not explaining principles, but lamenting the terrible state of the musical arts in the church, while praising those who have made some efforts.
 - In the Apostolic Letter, the Pope outlines principles, but is very clear that he considers it his “First Duty” to safeguard “the sanctity and dignity of the temple”.
 - N.B. He only addresses Modernism 4 years later.
 - The mess that was the musical arts is actually also an outgrowth of Modernism
 - Agnosticism and Vital Immanence puts focus on senses and emotions (Naturalism), so music that appeals to the emotions and entertains is closely tied.
 - Art, like Theology and Philosophy had its Romantic, and Modernist, then Post-Modernist, and revivalist phases
 - Pope compares himself to Our Lord casting out the moneychangers:

We do therefore publish, *motu proprio* and with certain knowledge, Our present *Instruction* to which, **as if it were a legal code for sacred music**, We will with the fulness of Our Apostolic Authority decree that the force of law be given, and We do by Our present handwriting impose its scrupulous observance on all.

- His main concern was to return to common use the Gregorian Chants, as reformed by Solesmes, both for the liturgical choir/schola, but also for the faithful

The ancient traditional Gregorian Chant must, therefore, in a large measure be restored to the functions of public worship, and the fact must be accepted by all that an ecclesiastical function loses none of its solemnity when accompanied by this music alone.

Special efforts are to be made to restore the use of the Gregorian Chant by the people, so that the faithful may again take a more active part in the ecclesiastical offices, as was the case in ancient times. (II, 3)

- Thus he wanted the faithful to sing the Ordinary of the Mass (Kyriale, Credo, Responses)
- He also wanted the faithful to be able to easily participate in the main liturgical hours like Vespers on Sundays and Feast Days
- He also wanted to establish Gregorian Chant as the prime analogue of Roman Church Music, on which all else was to be modeled.

These qualities are to be found, in the highest degree, in Gregorian Chant, which is, consequently the Chant proper to the Roman Church, the only chant she has inherited from the ancient fathers, which she has jealously guarded for centuries in her liturgical codices, which she directly proposes to the faithful as her own, which she prescribes exclusively for some parts of the liturgy, and which the most recent studies have so happily restored to their integrity and purity.

On these grounds Gregorian Chant has always been regarded as the supreme model for sacred music, so that it is fully legitimate to lay down the following rule: the more closely a composition for church approaches in its movement, inspiration and savor the Gregorian form, the more sacred and liturgical it becomes; and the more out of harmony it is with that supreme model, the less worthy it is of the temple. (II, 3)

- His secondary concern was to promote properly-ordered Sacred Polyphony

The above-mentioned qualities are also possessed in an excellent degree by Classic Polyphony, especially of the Roman School, which reached its greatest perfection in the sixteenth century, owing to the works of Pierluigi da Palestrina, and continued subsequently to produce compositions of excellent quality from a liturgical and musical standpoint. Classic Polyphony agrees admirably with Gregorian Chant, the supreme model of all sacred music, and hence it has been found worthy of a place side by side with Gregorian Chant, in the more solemn functions of the Church, such as those of the Pontifical Chapel.

- Note the important balance here : Polyphony should be restored, but only after Gregorian Chant, because Polyphony reflects the Chant's spirit.
- And since it is secondary, the main efforts to perform this should be at the most solemn functions.
 - Parishes should try, but should try first to perfect the chant.
 - And the kind of polyphony should be that similar to Palestrina (or the more simple falsobordone/fauxbordon recitative chants)
- He uses Palestrina as an example, not simply because he prefers Palestrina, but because this composer gives a good balance of harmony and counterpoint where the text is not obscured, but can be highlighted.
- He does not exclude future developments, but these have to fit the same principles.
- There are many others, but this was more to contrast Palestrina with the long, complex, orchestral Masses and motets, such as those of Bach, Mozart, etc..
 - This is not to devalue the musical quality of these compositions

- Mozart's *Requiem* for example is a masterpiece of musical beauty, but it is not proper liturgical music by the code that St. Pius X established.
 - It is nearly an hour long to sing texts that take about 10-15 minutes in the Gregorian.
 - This will mean that the priest will wait a long time doing nothing (which St. Pius X forbids)
 - Very quickly the focus is not on the aspect of prayer, but of creating some artistic effect.
- The question is one of fittingness for the liturgy
 - The liturgy is a public act of worship, not a concert
 - The idea of a "concert" or "artistic presentation" with a sermon and Communion is what Evangelical Protestants do.
 - The core of the Mass is the Sacrifice
 - Nothing should detract or distract from this
 - The music is meant to draw souls into the Sacrifice
 - This is by, of course, deepening contemplation
 - But it is also by a real participation (*participatio actuosa*)
 - This is not necessarily active, in the sense of needing to *do something*.
 - But it is at least an active attention and engagement with what is happening
 - By comparison, here we could say, it is like listening with a critical ear to a complex orchestral piece and trying to appreciate all of what one hears, versus just laying back and soaking it in mindlessly
 - Or with regard to tasting food or a fine wine: Not simply drinking or eating, but savoring each bite and contemplating the different flavors and aromas.
 - Music can do this, but it can also draw one away
 - Compare Mozart's *Requiem* to that of Cristóbal de Morales
 - Which keeps the spirit of the Gregorian Chant?
 - Both are beautiful and masterful works of art, and each is certainly contemplative in their own way
 - Both make the text that is being sung relatively clear in most sections
 - Morales clearly keeps the proper Gregorian spirit:
 - Major mode matching the Mode 6 of the chant, in fact, it is meant to imitate the chant which tries to give a hopeful, joyful preview of heaven
 - Slow and simple, relying mostly on the chordal harmony for tension.
 - Requires only men in normal male singing range for all of the parts
 - Mozart is an amazing work of art, but

- Minor modes which underly most pieces conveys the sadness of death, but not as clearly the hopefulness of the Resurrection
- Very ornate, divided into parts, with sudden swings in volume and timbre.
- Soloists all over the place
- The Dies Iræ is particularly problematic for the Church
 - Divided into several sections all of different character, so not unity
 - Soloists
 - Whole sequence is 14 minutes long
 - Compare with Morales which uses the actual chant except for the last stanza in polyphony which blends the Mode 1 chant with the themes from his Mode 6 Mass, for a 90 second addition to a 3 minute piece.
- St. Pius X is also open to the use of popular hymns and other modern music, but with limitations
- His secondary concern was to promote properly-ordered Sacred Polyphony

The Church has always recognized and favored the progress of the arts, admitting to the service of religion everything good and beautiful discovered by genius in the course of ages — always, however, with due regard to the liturgical laws. Consequently modern music is also admitted to the Church, since it, too, furnishes compositions of such excellence, sobriety and gravity, that they are in no way unworthy of the liturgical functions.

Still, since modern music has risen mainly to serve profane uses, greater care must be taken with regard to it, in order that the musical compositions of modern style which are admitted in the Church may contain nothing profane, be free from reminiscences of motifs adopted in the theaters, and be not fashioned even in their external forms after the manner of profane pieces.

This of its very nature is diametrically opposed to Gregorian Chant and classic polyphony, and therefore to the most important law of all good sacred music. Besides the intrinsic structure, the rhythm and what is known as the conventionalism of this style adapt themselves but badly to the requirements of true liturgical music. (II, 6)

- He makes a clear distinction between the purpose of the music and the styles that follow
 - Thomas Day in *Why Catholics Can't Sing* attributes much of this to the Irish-American influence
 - The experience of the Irish during British anti-Catholic occupation was one of great trials, poverty, and their experience of religion was quiet, hidden, and always fearful of persecution.
 - Compare with the Anglican-Nationalist Church which had large churches and grand liturgies with song (High Church)
 - The end of the worst persecutions was in the 19th century
 - What music developed came from the folk tunes of the Irish at the time and the musical styles of the time
 - Emigration to the United States meant conflict with the Italian, Spanish, and German immigrants where music was normal

- First generation no music
- Second generation needed to add music (hymns and folk), so manufactured pieces that people thought were Irish.
 - Day recalls a situation of an Irish musician being asked to play a string of “Irish” ballads, none of which he actually knows, despite them being so-called “Irish Folk Music” such as *My Wild Irish Rose*, or *Galway Bay*.
 - He refers to these as “Stage Irish” songs, that is, they were theatrical pieces that were meant to
 - “Irish” hymns for Mass, often borrowed these melodies or at least their style
- Example of the hymn “To Jesus Heart All Burning”
 - Linked song is badly sung, but is worth comparing with the early 20th century show tunes to see how inappropriate it is.
 - Compare with another beautiful piece sung by Gene Wilder in *Charlie and the Chocolate Factory* : *Pure Imagination*.
 - The music and style are theatrical.
- Written in mid-19th century, it is a typical sentimental, Romanic hymn of the era
- The text is highly pietistic, bridging on sentimental.
- This could be saved by a serious and dignified music. Unfortunately, the music is maudlin at best:
 - The hymns employs many non-diatonic chords (chords that are outside of the notes natural to the key)
 - By the end of the second bar, it employs a diminished seventh chord with both the alto and soprano sliding down a half step to a very dissonant chord (common to jazz, R&B and blues, show tunes, or marching/fight songs of the late 19th and early 20th century, not classic hymns.
 - The melody jumps all over the octave making congregational singing difficult, but solo or small group singing necessary
 - This made for the specialized (typically female-heavy) choir that sang such things
 - And the faithful were able to maintain their great silence.
 - It is designed for specialist and solo singing, while good hymns are designed for congregational singing.
 - Compare with any Gregorian hymn about the Sacred Heart, such as *Auctor beati sæculi*.
 - Compare with polyphonic hymns like *Cor arca legem continens*.

- *To Jesus Heart all Burning* is a perfect example of undignified music, unfit for the church, which is why it was placed on the Black List made by the Church Music Association of America/St. Cecilia's Society.
- They also banned such unfitting hymns of the same genre by name such as:
 - *On this day, O Beautiful Mother*
 - *Mother Dearest, Mother Fairest*
 - *Bring Flowers of the Rarest*
 - *O Lord, I am not worthy*
 - Unfortunately, these were commonplace American Catholic hymns.
- Compare these with another more noble favorite :
Holy God we Praise Thy Name
- Thomas Day highlights the problem :

On September 12, 1953, Jacqueline Bouvier and Senator John F. Kennedy were married. The music for this sumptuous society event had to be nothing but the best. A tenor, up in the choir loft sang *Mother, at Your Feet is Kneeling, To Jesus' Heart All Burning, O Lord, I am Not Worthy* {with the barbershop-quartet tune by Burns), and Schubert's *Ave Maria*.

Ten years later, President John F. Kennedy was assassinated. A grief stricken nation watched President Kennedy's funeral on television, and many non-Catholic viewers wondered what type of ceremony this would be. Here was a great religion with an impressive legacy of religious music; here was the funeral of the first Roman Catholic president of the United States, and the heads of state from all over the world would be in the congregation. The music had to be nothing but the best. While Cardinal Cushing barked his way through the Low Mass, up in the choir loft the same tenor from President Kennedy's wedding sang the same old parlor ballads heard at the 1953 Nuptial Mass.

- Day was a bit incorrect about the actual music sung which was in fact "Pie Jesu," Leybach (tenor solo), "Ave Maria," Schubert (tenor solo); "In Manus Tuus," Novello (tenor solo); "Sanctus and Benedictus," Perosi (choir).
- The majority of these have a theatrical character, and the method of execution saw them sung over top of Cardinal Cushing loudly reciting the Latin of the Requiem Mass in a nasal New England
- St. Pius X set very clear principles that what is fitting for the tavern, or theater, even to some degree what is folk music, is not appropriate for the Church, even if the words are changed to make them Catholic.
 - Thus the CMAA would ban the use of"
 - Schubert's *Ave Maria*, because it was an operatic selection taken from *Lady of the Lake*, a prayer to Our Lady offered by a character in a operetta, which was not the text of the actual *Ave Maria*.
 - It later was used in Disney's *Fantasia*.
 - There is nothing wrong with it's use in these contexts, but this makes it

as unfitting for the Church as other popular music were we to adapt the text.

- Bach-Gounod's *Ave Maria* for the same reasons above. It was a chamber music piece by Bach, to which the text of the *Ave Maria* was later set.
 - Fine chamber music
 - Not fit for the Church
- The Wedding March in *Lohengrin*, and Mendhelson's *Midsummer Night's Dream*.
 - Both are from operas, and unfitting of the Church
- The issue of women in singing
 - St. Pius X and the Sacred Congregation of Rites under Leo XIII were very clear that the Church forbids women to sing what is proper to the "choir of Levites" – That is the Propers of the Mass.
 - The only exception envisioned is for convents in their own chapels
 - By extension we could easily include convent schools, or similar girls' schools where there it is not proper to have a schola of men
 - But where women's and girls' scholas are formed for pariochial churches is an abuse, clearly contrary to
 - Pius XII and the Sacred Congregation of Rites, however, did tolerate some leniency in this, allowing where it was truly impossible to have suitable male voices, that a mixed choir be formed

Wherever such a choir [f men and boys] cannot be organized, a choir of the faithful, either mixed or consisting only of women or girls, can be permitted. But such a choir should take its place outside the sanctuary or Communion rail. The men should be separated from the women or girls so that anything unbecoming may be avoided. (*Musicæ Sacræ*, no. 74)
 - While it seems that St. Pius X would exclude women from a choir that would sing motets or non-liturgical chant, there does seem to be some leeway here.
 - Practically, the type of male sopranos and choirs found in English churches and the old cathedral schools do not exist.
 - There is a practicality, but there are also principles
 - Work towards a situation where the ideal is possible, without making the perfect the enemy of the good.
 - This does not exclude the singing of sacred music outside of the liturgy by mixed choirs, or sacred music performances with women only.
- **Later regulations add some practicality**
 - **Musicæ Sacræ (Pius XII)**
 - **De musica sacra et sacra liturgia**

SUMMARY AND PRACTICAL TAKEAWAYS

- **General Rules and Thoughts to Consider**

- **At a Low Mass,**
 - It is permitted:
 - For the organ to play (outside of Lent, Advent, Penitential Days, and Requiems)
 - To sing Gregorian Chant and suitable hymns (even in the vernacular)
 - It is not permitted to:
 - Let the singing or organ impede the hearing of the Mass
 - Use hymns or music that the church would otherwise forbid
 - It should be considered
 - If there is a choir that can sing, perhaps the Mass should be Sung
- **At a Sung or Solemn Mass,**
 - It is permitted:
 - For the organ to play (outside of Lent, Advent, Penitential Days, and Requiems)
 - During the processional,
 - To accompany the chant and Kyriale,
 - During the time after the Offertory is sung,
 - After the consecration (if this is customary),
 - During the distribution of Communion,
 - As a recessional
 - As a postlude
 - To sing Gregorian Chant and suitable hymns during the proper times of the Mass (when required, or when the organ could play)
 - It is not permitted to:
 - Accompany the chant of the ministers (Orations, Epistle, Gospel, Preface)
 - Use hymns or motets not in Liturgical Greek or Latin.
 - Use hymns or music that the church would forbid
 - It should be considered
 - There ought to be a difference between Sundays in Paschaltide and Lent, so the degree of feast, and the season should set the type of music used.
 - Unaccompanied singing is the Church's model, so the organ not always accompany the singers, unless they are so weak this is necessary.
- **Gregorian Chant should have pride of place**
 - A choir should first focus on being able to sing Gregorian hymns, and perfecting the chant, not polyphony or hymns
 - Practically, when starting out, and at a chapel that only has a few singers and Low Mass, it may be necessary to have the faithful learn a few standard hymn to begin any singing, but even here, the simple Gregorian hymns would be best.
 - Once the chant can be properly sung and sung well, then a choir can branch out into more challenging polyphony and hymns.
- **Polyphony**
 - The style should reflect the chant and Palestrina as the model
 - Modern styles are not forbidden, but often these stay very far from Palestrina.

- Ironically, some very model composers are better than the 18-19th century (e.g. Morten Lauridsen's *O Magnum Myserium*, or Kevin Allen's Three Voice Motets)
- **Hymns**
 - Angelus Press has the *Traditional Roman Hymnal* (Second Edition) with a good selection of both Gregorian and polyphonic hymns.
 - Avoid unbecoming hymns

LINKS TO VIDEOS/PIECES REFERENCED

- **Jacob Collier (Audience Choir)** : <https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=3KsF309XpJo>
- **Falsobordone Chant** : <https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=fFrGqjUYceg>
- **Processional Hymn** : <https://youtu.be/shihFsKnqu0?t=12486>
- **Introit** : <https://youtu.be/shihFsKnqu0?t=12674>
- **Kyrie (II)** : <https://youtu.be/shihFsKnqu0?t=12846>
- **Gloria (II)** : <https://youtu.be/shihFsKnqu0?t=13063>
- **Epistle** : <https://youtu.be/shihFsKnqu0?t=13378>
- **Gradual & Alleluia** : <https://youtu.be/shihFsKnqu0?t=13473>
- **Gospel** : <https://youtu.be/shihFsKnqu0?t=13778>
- **Credo (III)** : <https://youtu.be/shihFsKnqu0?t=14010>
- **Agnus Dei (II)** : <https://youtu.be/shihFsKnqu0?t=15513>
- **Communion Antiphon & Versicles** : <https://youtu.be/shihFsKnqu0?t=15854>
- **Te Deum (Hymn)** : <https://youtu.be/shihFsKnqu0?t=16705>
- **Recessional (Sequence)** : <https://youtu.be/shihFsKnqu0?t=17073>
- **de Morales, Cristóbal – Requiem**
 - **Introit & Kyrie** : https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=TTtPxltC7_w
 - **Pie Jesu (Dies Iræ) & Offertory** : <https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=umW2GALmY2w>
 - **Sanctus, Agnus Dei, Communion** : <https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=2xvAy85WfGE>
- **Mozart, Wolfgang Amadeus – Requiem**
 - **Whole with Chapters** : <https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=Dp2SjN4UiE4>
 - **Introit** : <https://youtu.be/Dp2SjN4UiE4?t=80>
 - **Kyrie** : <https://youtu.be/Dp2SjN4UiE4?t=346>
 - **Dies Iræ** : <https://youtu.be/Dp2SjN4UiE4?t=494>
 - **Offertory** : <https://youtu.be/Dp2SjN4UiE4?t=1552>
 - **Sanctus** : <https://youtu.be/Dp2SjN4UiE4?t=1972>
 - **Agnus Dei** : <https://youtu.be/Dp2SjN4UiE4?t=2332>
 - **Communion** : <https://youtu.be/Dp2SjN4UiE4?t=2505>
- **To Jesus' Heart All Burning** : <https://youtu.be/HoRVUUIocnA?t=46>
- **Pure Imagination** : <https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=SVi3-PrQ0pY>
- **Funeral Mass of President Kennedy** : <https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=kPXswoTcL0g>
- **Kevin Allen (O Sacrum Convivium)** : <https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=4AWMrYoC4sw>